

HOW CHINA FUELS AFRICAN KLEPTOCRATIC NETWORKS

THE CASE OF CONGO-BRAZZAVILLE

// ANDREA NGOMBET MALEWA, THE SASSOUFIT COLLECTIVE

Over the past decade, Beijing has emerged as a powerful accelerator of long-standing kleptocracy in the Republic of the Congo, also known as Congo-Brazzaville. The Central African state is far from alone in this respect, but it is a useful example for understanding the political, economic, and cultural consequences of the growing Chinese Communist Party (CCP) influence in the region and in Africa more broadly.

The People's Republic of China (PRC) is now the primary importer of petroleum and timber from Congo-Brazzaville. While developing this trade, Beijing and CCP-linked businesspeople engaged with local kleptocratic elites and situated themselves within corrupt networks. Moreover, in 2015 the two countries established the Sino-Congolese Bank for Africa, an entity whose practices have troubling implications for transparency and accountability in Congo-Brazzaville and beyond.

Kleptocracy is a leading cause of underdevelopment, human rights abuses, and war on the African continent, particularly in Central Africa. Ten of the eleven countries in the region are classified as Not Free by Freedom House,¹ and three of the five longest-ruling national leaders worldwide—monarchs excluded—are from Central Africa.² In Congo-Brazzaville, kleptocrats have siphoned off billions of dollars in revenue from natural resources and amassed portfolios of private property worth tens of millions each. Meanwhile, nearly 40 percent of the country's people are forced to live on less than two dollars a day, and public health institutions struggle to provide basic services.³

The kleptocratic monopolization of power in Central Africa follows a general—and widely repeated—pattern. First, would-be kleptocrats in government and their allies in the business world identify key natural resources that have the potential to generate tremendous wealth and influence. Then, rather than using the proceeds to deliver public goods, kleptocrats enrich themselves and work to neuter accountability mechanisms that might hinder their theft, including independent auditing and judicial systems, a free press and civil society, and political competition through fair elections. Finally, as the system becomes more closed, authoritarian, and violent, more extensive plunder becomes possible, fueling a downward spiral.⁴

The CCP's emergence as a crucial enabler of regional kleptocrats makes it more difficult for local democratic forces to advocate for open and responsive governance. In the struggle to rein in kleptocratic networks in Central Africa, civil society within these countries must be empowered to play a more coordinated and purposeful role in exposing the CCP's corrosive influence.

Growing Chinese Influence over a System of National Plunder

In the Republic of the Congo, Beijing has long supported the regime led by Denis Sassou Nguesso, who first captured the presidency in 1979, fomented armed rebellion against his successor in the mid-1990s, and returned to office in 1997. Chinese engagement with Congolese kleptocratic networks ranges from murky relationships at the elite level to commercial activity in the country's highly lucrative oil and timber industries.

As with many resource-rich African countries, the Republic of the Congo has "local content" provisions that require the involvement of Congolese businesses and employees in the extraction and export of Congolese crude oil. Due to the deeply kleptocratic nature of the Congolese state, foreign entities aiming to acquire Congolese oil must purchase from locally-run businesses that are likely to be compromised by corruption and operated by members of the ruling family; an unsavory proposition for companies based in democratic countries where they could face legal or reputational repercussions. The French-owned Total and Italian-owned ENI oil companies have historically enjoyed a dominant position in the sector, but today most of the high-quality oil from the Djeno region of Congo-Brazzaville is exported to China, where the trade entails far less liability.⁶

The region's timber industry was similarly dominated by European companies in the past, but the PRC has become its largest market, accounting for 46 percent of the Congo Basin's timber exports in value as of 2016.⁷ The Dejia Group, a bloc of companies controlled by Chinese tycoon Xu Gong De, has allegedly used its corrupt local connections in Gabon and the Republic of the Congo to amass territorial concessions illegally, exceed harvesting quotas, and avoid paying millions of dollars in corporate taxes in the two countries.⁸

In the struggle to rein in kleptocratic networks in Central Africa, civil society within these countries must be empowered to play a more coordinated and purposeful role in exposing the CCP's corrosive influence.

The Rise of a New and Opaque Banking Network

One of the most alarming results of Sino-Congolese cooperation in recent years has been the establishment of a banking structure that allows money to move across international borders without the standard accountability and transparency measures associated with financial institutions based in the democratic world.

Central African kleptocrats have a long history of establishing banks that help them funnel ill-gotten wealth out of their countries. During the late 1990s, President Sassou Nguesso and Gabon's President Ali Bongo started the BGFI Bank, which now has subsidiaries in ten countries in West and Central Africa and has been accused of involvement in large-scale money laundering. In 2021, a leak of BGFI data—later known as the "Congo Hold Up"—that was obtained by the Platform to Protect African Whistleblowers revealed a massive corruption scheme involving the bank, two PRC state-owned enterprises, and family members of then president Joseph Kabila in the neighboring Democratic Republic of the Congo. 10

The PRC entered the regional banking sector in 2015 with the creation of the Sino-Congolese Bank for Africa, a joint venture between the state-owned Agricultural Bank of China and the government of Congo-Brazzaville. The bank may be particularly attractive to Sassou Nguesso and his allies because it limits their exposure to French prosecutors, who have turned their attention to the president and his relatives after obtaining corruption convictions against Equatorial Guinea's ruling Obiang family in recent years.¹¹

While the amount of money going through the Sino-Congolese Bank is currently unclear, the dangers associated with this alternative banking system are quite apparent. Kleptocrats in general, rely on foreign banks to convert the local proceeds of corruption into stable currencies like the dollar or the euro, and to store these funds in ways and locations that will make them safe from scrutiny or seizure. But banks operating in the United States and Europe—or connected to those democratic settings through correspondent banks—are increasingly obliged to operate under strict anti-money-laundering and "know your customer" provisions that make them riskier partners for corrupt actors. Furthermore, any financial transaction conducted using the U.S. dollar has the potential to be examined by U.S. law enforcement agencies.

A reliable Chinese banking option could allow Central African kleptocrats to better obscure the origins of their assets or avoid the democracy-based financial sector altogether. Crucially, the Sino-Congolese Bank offers access to the PRC's renminbi-denominated interbank payments network, a rival to the Belgium-based Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunications (SWIFT). The SWIFT network, which enables member banks around the world to communicate quickly, also provides data that the U.S. Treasury Department uses to trace financial flows, combat illicit finance, and ensure third-party compliance with sanctions.¹²

Central African kleptocrats have a long history of establishing banks that help them funnel ill-gotten wealth out of their countries.

Strengthening Civil Society's Push for Transparency

African civil society faces daunting obstacles in its efforts to expose Beijing's corrupting influence in Central Africa. Tackling the local dimensions of kleptocracy is difficult enough, but the CCP's growing interest in the region compounds the problem significantly. Like their counterparts in much of the rest of the world, African civil society organizations often lack the capacity and specialized knowledge that are essential for tracking Beijing's financial flows and PRC actors' complex economic relationships with local kleptocrats. Anticorruption activists also run the risk of being labeled as enemies of progress and development, since much of the continent's modern infrastructure has been built by Chinese firms. Indeed, many have regarded these economic contributions as reasons to stay silent. Such observers tend to overlook the fact that the opening and globalization of the continent's economies can, if managed improperly, also facilitate corruption and hasten the movement of both resources and wealth out of Africa.¹³

In addition, whereas civil society activists seeking justice for abuses in Africa by European or American companies, for example, have had some chance of bringing their cases before an impartial court in the firms' home countries, ¹⁴ it is almost impossible to pursue similar cases against PRC-based companies. The court system in China is tightly controlled by the CCP and does not enforce international standards of transparency and accountability.

Despite these barriers, there are concrete steps that civil society can take to counter corrupting PRC influence in the region. First, civil society organizations must meticulously document the activities of Chinese actors in Africa. They must collect information on cases of rights violations, interference, and corruption to give the public a clearer understanding of Beijing's engagement and, over time, greater agency in their countries' relationship with the PRC. Such documentation should also be preserved in the hope that it could be used in court to hold Chinese perpetrators to account if political or legal conditions were to change in the future.

Second, civil society activists should focus on educating the public about the financial, social, and ecological costs of the development projects Beijing has pushed. For example, working with the youth of Congo-Brazzaville's remote Cuvette-Ouest Department, the Sassoufit Collective—a Paris-based nongovernmental organization advocating for democracy, human rights, and anti-corruption efforts in Congo-Brazzaville and elsewhere in Africa—shed light on the environmental destruction caused by a Sino-Congolese enterprise, AGIL Congo. After this news was released, journalist Blanche Simona, a grantee of the Pulitzer Center's Rainforest Journalist Fund, followed up with a compelling series of reports about the pollution caused by AGIL Congo's operations.

African
civil society
organizations
often lack the
capacity and
specialized
knowledge that
are essential
for tracking
Beijing's financial
flows and PRC
actors' complex
economic
relationships with
local kleptocrats.

Third, African civil society should actively respond to CCP narratives aimed at promoting Beijing as a partner that understands and will not duplicate Africa's experience with European colonization, given that China and Africa share histories of exploitation at the hands of European powers. To debunk this benevolent image of the PRC regime, African activists should forge relationships with the civil society sectors and democracy movements of Hong Kong and the Tibetan and Uyghur diasporas. It is also imperative to open dialogues with Asian democracies such as Taiwan, Japan, and South Korea, as well as establish collaborative initiatives to uphold democratic principles and build resilience in the face of CCP influence. By pledging \$100 million to support democracy around the world, President Yoon Suk Yeol of South Korea is making a significant step in the battle for a free and open international system. The Sassoufit Collective called on President Yoon Suk Yeol not to overlook African civil society organizations by dedicating a significant part of this support fund to the continent.¹⁷

Above all, it is up to African civil society to compile a comprehensive list of Chinese state-affiliated businesses and their African enablers. Just as international organizations like Public Eye, Global Witness, Environmental Investigation Agency, and Traffic prepare such reports on their respective issues, African civil society communities should work together to share their knowledge of Beijing-enabled kleptocracy across Africa.

An Interregional Problem that Calls for Interregional Solutions

The PRC and its affiliated enterprises are making deep inroads in Central Africa and the continent as a whole, fueling kleptocratic networks that seem to be intensifying corrupt practices and human rights abuses in an already fragile region. Some novel approaches will be required to meet this complex challenge, including heavy investment by democracies that understand the urgent need for an alternative to Chinese funding—one that is grounded in respect for human rights, good governance, transparency, and the rule of law. When offering economic assistance to African governments, democracies and international financial institutions should insist on these conditions, and couple any funding with effective public outreach that explains the benefits of relying on democratic partners.

But Beijing's support for kleptocracy in Africa cannot be addressed solely by governments or lenders in Europe and the United States. The region's authoritarian leaders are adept at using past abuses by colonial powers to deflect present-day pressure to combat corruption. African activists must look elsewhere, particularly to their colleagues in the PRC's own neighborhood, to cultivate networks of support and collaboration that will be more effective at exposing the tendrils of illicit money and influence linking Beijing to Africa. By working together and sharing their findings with local and international independent media, civil society groups could help persuade the citizens of Congo-Brazzaville and other African countries that opaque CCP-led development is not the path to a brighter future.

The PRC and its affiliated enterprises are making deep inroads in Central Africa and the continent as a whole, fueling kleptocratic networks that seem to be intensifying corrupt practices and human rights abuses in an already fragile region.

ENDNOTES

Criminal States, Militarized Criminals, and Profiteers: Russia, Africa, and the Evolving Ecosystem of Transnational Kleptocracy

- "Putin: PMC Wagner was fully funded by state budget," *Novaya Gazeta Europe*, 27 June 2023, https://novayagazeta.eu/articles/2023/06/27/putin-pmc-wagner-was-fully-funded-by-state-budget-en-news.
- 2 Simon Marks and Mohammed Alamine, "Russian Forces Help Secure Central Africa Gold Zone in New Pact," Bloomberg, 1 February 2023, https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2023-02-01/russian-forces-help-secure-central-africa-gold-zone-in-new-pact#xj4y7vzkg.
- 3 "Prigozhin's criminal past, straight from the source: A complete translation of one of the court documents from the case that sent 'Putin's chef' to prison, four decades ago," Meduza, 29 June 2021, https://meduza.io/en/feature/2021/06/29/prigozhin-s-criminal-past-straight-from-the-source.
- 4 Greg Myre, "Putin's Chef Has His Fingers In Many Pies, Critics Say," NPR, 30 January 2019, www.npr.org/2019/01/30/685622639/putins-chef-has-his-fingers-in-many-pies-critics-say.
- Treasury Targets Assets of Russian Financier who Attempted to Influence 2018 U.S. Elections," U.S. Department of the Treasury, 30 September 2019, https://home.treasury.gov/news/press-releases/sm787.
- For more information, please see Anne Applebaum's remarks at the nineteenth annual Syemour Martin Lipsett Lecture: Anne Applebaum, "Autocracy Inc.," 1 December 2022, www.ned.org/events/nineteenth-lipset-lecture-anne-applebaum-autocracy-inc/.
- 7 "Treasury Targets Financier's Illicit Sanctions Evasion Activity," U.S. Department of the Treasury, 15 July 2020, https://home.treasury.gov/news/press-releases/sm1058.
- 8 "Wagner Group: Council adds 11 individuals and 7 entities to EU sanctions lists," Council of the European Union, 25 February 2023, www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2023/02/25/wagner-group-council-adds-11-individuals-and-7-entities-to-eu-sanctions-lists/.
- 9 Joseph Siegle, "How Russia is pursuing state capture in Africa," London School of Economics (*Africa at LSE* Blog), 21 March 2022, https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/africaatlse/2022/03/21/how-russia-is-pursuing-state-capture-in-africa-ukraine-wagner-group/.
- Julia Stanyard, Thierry Vircoulon, and Julian Rademeyer, *The Grey Zone: Russia's military, mercenary, and criminal engagement in Africa*, Global Initiative Against Transnational Organized Crime, 16 February 2023, https://globalinitiative.net/analysis/russia-in-africa/.
- 11 Matthew Paige and Jodi Vittori, *Kleptocratic Adaptation: Anticipating the Next Stage in the Battle Against Transnational Kleptocracy*, National Endowment for Democracy, 17 January 2023, www.ned.org/kleptocratic-adaptation-anticipating-the-next-stage-in-the-battle-against-transnational-kleptocracy/.
- 12 Please see, for example, the 2021 Organized Crime Index by the Global Initiative against Transnational Organized Crime, available at: https://ocindex.net/.

How China Fuels African Kleptocratic Networks: The Case of Congo-Brazzaville

- Central Africa is generally understood to comprise eleven countries: Angola, Burundi, Chad, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon, Cameroon, the Central African Republic, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, the Republic of the Congo, Rwanda, and São Tomé and Príncipe. All but São Tomé and Príncipe are classified as "Not Free" according to Freedom House. For more information, please see: "Central Africa and the EU," European External Action Service, 13 July 2022, www.eeas.europa.eu/eeas/central-africa-and-eu_en; and "Countries and Territories," Freedom House, 2023, https://freedomhouse.org/countries/freedom-world/scores.
- 2 Claire Klobucista, "Africa's 'Leaders for Life," Council on Foreign Relations, 30 June 2021, www.cfr.org/backgrounder/africas-leaders-life.
- "Assets Abound: Tracking the Assets of Congo-Brazzaville Kleptocrats," Opening Central Africa, 22 September 2021, https://openingcentralafrica.com/en/2021/09/22/assets-abound-tracking-the-assets-of-congo-brazzaville-kleptocrats; and "Welcome to the #Kleptolands: Republic of the Congo," Opening Central Africa, YouTube, 7 March 2022, www.youtube.com/watch?v=RENV5JYI7Iw.

- 4 "Andréa Ngombet: How to get away with state capture," The Stanford Center on Democracy, Development and the Rule of Law (CDDRL), YouTube, 8 December 2022, www.youtube.com/watch?v=EVFtpekEtfl.
- David Servenay, "Trafic d'armes: Le dispositif de Jacques Monsieur," Radio France Internationale (RFI), 6 December 2004, www1.rfi.fr/actufr/articles/060/article-32272.asp; and Spyros Demetriou, Robert Muggah, and Ian Biddle, Small Arms Availability, Trade and Impacts in the Republic of Congo, the Small Arms Survey, study commissioned by the International organisation for Migration and the United Nations Development Programme, April 2002, www.files.ethz.ch/isn/87826/2002-04-No2_Small%20Arms%20Availabilty%20Republic%20Congo.pdf.
- 6 Agathe Duparc, Marc Guéniat, and Olivier Longchamp, *Gunvor in Congo: Oil, Cash, and Misappropriation—the Adventures of a Swiss Trader in Brazzaville*, Public Eye, September 2017, www.publiceye.ch/fr/publications/detail/gunvor-au-congo-rapport.
- 7 Toxic Trade: Forest Crime in Gabon and the Republic of Congo and Contamination of the US Market, Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), 25 March 2019, https://us.eia.org/report/20190325-toxic-trade.
- 8 "Press Release: Toxic Trade: Forest Crime in Gabon and the Republic of Congo and Contamination of the US Market," EIA, 25 March 2019, https://us.eia.org/press-releases/20190325-toxic-trade-pr/.
- "The Bank at the Heart of the Scandal," *Africa Confidential*, 62:24, 2 December 2021, www.africa-confidential.com/article/id/13684/The bank at the heart of the scandal.
- 10 *The Backchannel: State Capture and Bribery in Congo's Deal of the Century,* the Sentry, November 2021, https://thesentry.org/reports/backchannel/.
- 11 Forthcoming paper by Brett Carter on "How the New Cold War Will Shape Africa's Future."
- 12 Barry Eichengreen, "Sanctions, SWIFT, and China's Cross-Border Interbank Payments System" part of *the Marshall Papers*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), 20 May 2022, www.csis.org/analysis/sanctions-swift-and-chinas-cross-border-interbank-payments-system.
- 13 Oliver Bullough, "The Rise of Kleptocracy: The Dark Side of Globalization," *Journal of Democracy* 29, no. 1 (January 2018): 25–38.
- 14 Tutu Alicante, *To Catch a Kleptocrat: Lessons Learned from the Biens Mal Acquis Trials in France*, National Endowment for Democracy, June 2019, www.ned.org/to-catch-a-kleptocrat-lessons-learned-biens-mal-acquis-trials-tutu-alicante/.
- 15 The author, Andrea Ngombet Malewa, is the founder of the Sassoufit Collective.
- Blanche Simona, "Exploitation de l'Or à Kellé Dans la Cuvette-Ouest," Rainforest Journalism Fund, 16 September 2022, https://rainforestjournalismfund.org/fr/projects/exploitation-de-lor-kelle-dans-la-cuvette-ouest.
- 17 Damon Wilson (@DamonMacWilson), "Welcome to Washington @President_KR! Yoon Suk Yeol is pushing South Korea to be a global pivotal state including by contributing \$100 million to support democracy around the world. Thank you for your leadership," Twitter, 27 April 2023, https://twitter.com/DamonMacWilson/status/1651741490840842241.

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Andrea Ngombet Malewa is a civil society leader, a former Reagan-Fascell fellow at the National Endowment for Democracy, and a Stanford Draper Hill fellow. He is also a member of the International Coalition for Democratic Renewal and founder of the #Sassoufit Collective, an organization that advocates for democracy and rule of law in the Republic of the Congo. He holds a Bachelor degree in History from Sorbonne Paris IV university. Follow him on Twitter @andrea ngombet.

J.R. Mailey is a senior expert at the Global Initiative Against Transnational Organized Crime (GI-TOC), where he works on corruption, organized crime, and illicit financial flows. Prior to joining GI-TOC, he was Director of Investigations for the Sentry, overseeing investigations into financial crimes and corruption linked to violence and atrocities. Prior to joining the Sentry and the Enough Project, J.R. was a research associate at the Africa Center for Strategic Studies, where he specialized in natural resources, corruption, and security in Africa. While at the Africa Center, he authored the ACSS Special Report, "The Anatomy of the Resource Curse: Predatory Investment in Africa's Extractive Industries." He also previously worked as a researcher for the U.S.-China Economic & Security Review Commission, where he was co-author of "The 88 Queensway Group: A Case Study in Chinese Investors' Operations in Angola and Beyond." Follow him on Twitter @MaileyJR.

ABOUT THE EDITOR

Melissa Aten is a senior program officer at the International Forum for Democratic Studies, a center for research and analysis at the National Endowment for Democracy, where she specializes in transnational kleptocracy and its impact on democracy and governance around the world. She is the co-author of the January 2018 *Journal of Democracy* article, "The Rise of Kleptocracy: A Challenge for Democracy," and as editor of several kleptocracy-related publications. In her spare time, she is a passionate advocate for animal adoption, holding multiple volunteer positions at a Washington, DC-based animal rescue. She holds an MA in International Relations from the George Washington University and a BA in English Literature from St. Edward's University in Austin, Texas. Follow her on Twitter @melissaaten.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors are grateful for the contributions of the International Forum's staff and leadership, including Christopher Walker, John K. Glenn, Kevin Sheives, John Engelken, Ariane Gottlieb, and Lily Sabol, all of whom played important roles in the editing and publication of this paper. Particular acknowledgment goes to Melissa Aten, whose support and vision for this project were invaluable to its completion. Andrea Ngombet Malewa and J.R. Mailey also are grateful to Brett Carter and Joe Siegle, respectively, for lending their expertise and knowledge to further sharpen the analysis presented in this report, as well as Tyler Roylance for his careful copyedit. Finally, the Forum wishes to thank Factor3 Digital for their efforts and invaluable support in producing graphical elements and designing this report for publication.

PHOTO CREDITS

Cover image: Photo by ESB Professional/Shutterstock

Page 3: Photo by da-kuk/Getty Images

Page 9: Photo by traffic_analyzer/Getty Images





The International Forum for Democratic Studies at the National Endowment for Democracy

(NED) is a leading center for analysis and discussion of the theory and practice of democracy around the world. The Forum complements NED's core mission—assisting civil society groups abroad in their efforts to foster and strengthen democracy—by linking the academic community with activists from across the globe. Through its multifaceted activities, the Forum responds to challenges facing countries around the world by analyzing opportunities for democratic transition, reform, and consolidation. The Forum pursues its goals through several interrelated initiatives: publishing the *Journal of Democracy*, the world's leading publication on the theory and practice of democracy; hosting fellowship programs for international democracy activists, journalists, and scholars; coordinating a global network of think tanks; and undertaking a diverse range of analytical initiatives to explore critical themes relating to democratic development.



The National Endowment for Democracy (NED) is a private, nonprofit foundation dedicated to the growth and strengthening of democratic institutions around the world. Each year, NED makes more than 1,700 grants to support the projects of nongovernmental groups abroad who are working for democratic goals in more than 90 countries. Since its founding in 1983, the Endowment has remained on the leading edge of democratic struggles everywhere, while evolving into a multifaceted institution that is a hub of activity, resources, and intellectual exchange for activists, practitioners, and scholars of democracy the world over.

